



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS  
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

Communicated on 30 August 2017

THIRD SECTION

Application no. 19809/11  
Zarema Musayevna ABAZOVA and others  
against Russia  
lodged on 25 February 2011

STATEMENT OF FACTS

The seventy-five applicants in the present case are Russian nationals who at the time of the events, in 1999, were resident in the village of Elistanzhi in the Vedeno district, the Chechen Republic. The list of the applicants and their current places of residence is set out in the appendix.

The applicants are represented before the Court by lawyers from the Committee against Torture, a non-governmental organisation in Nizhniy Novgorod, Russia.

The facts of the case, as submitted by the applicants, may be summarised as follows.

**A. Events of 7 October 1999**

*1. Preliminary information*

Military clashes between the Russian military and the local guerilla troops started in Chechnya at the beginning of autumn of 1999.

Aerial attacks by the Russian military on the civilian population in Chechnya have been examined by the Court in a number of judgments, such as *Isayeva v. Russia*, no. 57950/00, 24 February 2005, *Abuyeva and Others v. Russia*, no. 27065/05, 2 December 2010, *Kerimova and Others v. Russia*, nos. 17170/04 and 5 others, 3 May 2011, and *Abakarova v. Russia*, no. 16664/07, 15 October 2015. These applications were lodged by residents of Katyr-Yurt and Urus-Martan, Chechnya, who alleged that their relatives had been killed or wounded and that they themselves had suffered injuries during aerial strikes on their villages in 1999 and 2000.

*2. Events of 7 October 1999 in the village of Elistanzhi*

Between 12 and 1 p.m. on 7 October 1999 the village of Elistanzhi in the Vedeno district was subjected to an aerial strike by Russian military forces.

According to the applicants, there were no military or other facilities, or objects which could have been perceived as such, in the village or in the vicinity at the material time and the attack was therefore unprovoked and sudden.

A number of buildings, including the local school, were destroyed in the attack. Thirty-five residents of the village were killed and sixty were wounded. According to the applicants, the following residents of their village were either killed during the attack or were badly wounded and died shortly thereafter:

1. Mr Ramzan Appazov, born in 1927;
2. Ms Shamsa Artsayeva (also known as Artsuyeva);
3. Mr Shamsuddin Artsuyev, born in 1988;
4. Ms Taisa Artsuyeva, born in 1989;
5. Ms Epsi Artsuyeva (also known as Gekhayeva), born in 1920;
6. Mr Iznaur (also known as Artur) Artsuyev, born in 1982;
7. Ms Milana (also known as Shamsa and Shamsan) Artsuyeva, born in 1984;
8. Mr Zaur Artsuyev, born in 1990;
9. Mr Anzor (also known as Rakhman) Artsuyev, born in 1997;
10. Ms Petimat Visarigova, born in 1991;
11. Ms Madina Gabayeva, born in 1956;
12. Mr Adam Gekhayev, born in 1937;
13. Ms Ayshat Gekhayeva, born in 1940;
14. Ms Khizhan Dosuyeva (also known as Gekhayeva), born in 1928;
15. Mr Supyan Dudayev, born in 1947;
16. Mr Aslan Dudayev, born in 1973;
17. Mr Usman Dudayev, born in 1955;
18. Mr Rakhman Dudayev, born between 1985-1987;
19. Ms Amsar Durdiyeva, born in 1957;
20. Mr Lechi Dzhabraïlov, born in 1977;
21. Mr Abubakar Dudayev, born in 1952;
22. Ms Toara (also known as Toar) Ismailova, born in 1928;
23. Ms Ibnat Mezhidova, born in 1928;
24. Mr Islam Mukhmadov, born in 1976;
25. Ms Malkan Mukhmadova, born in 1974;
26. Mr Asvad (also known as Sar-Ali) Nadayev, born between 1974-1981;
27. Ms Ima (also known as Imani) Osupova, born between 1978-1979;
28. Ms Satsita Petirova, born in 1985;
29. Ms Eset Saitova (also known as Saparova), born in 1961;
30. Mr Islam Saitov, born in 1994;
31. Mr Musa Tasuyev, born in 1982;
32. Mr Albert Khamzatov (also known as Adam Khalezatov and Khazatov), born between 1991 and 1995;
33. Mr Imran Chumakov (also known as Islam Chumanov), born between 1984-1989;
34. Mr Nesirkho Yunayev, born in 1957;
35. Mr Movladi Yangulbayev, born in 1925.

In the applicants' submission, the following persons sustained various injuries as the result of the airstrike of 7 October 1999:

1. Ms Zarema Abazova, born in 1976;
2. Mr Khaseyn Appazov, born in 1982;

3. Mr Shaykh-Mansur (also known as Sheykh-Manur) Artsuyev, born in 1999;
4. Mr Saykhan Artsuyev (also known as Abdulsalamov), born in 1991;
5. Ms Luiza Artsuyeva, born in 1992;
6. Ms Petimat Akhazayeva, born in 1972;
7. Ms Laura Akhmatkhanova, born in 1986;
8. Ms Zara Badayeva, born in 1966;
9. Ms Malika Velkuyeva;
10. Ms Roza Visarigova, born in 1996;
11. Ms Aminat Gaziyeva (also known as Chumakova), born in 1965;
12. Mr Sharip (also spelled as Sherip) Gastiyev, born in 1978;
13. Mr Sirazhdin Gastiyev, born in 1970;
14. Ms Khazan Gatsayeva, born in 1939;
15. Ms Zulay Davletmurzayeva, born in 1947;
16. Ms Zulpa Davletmurzayeva, born in 1972;
17. Mr Islam Davletmurzayev, born in 1994;
18. Ms Zargan Datayeva, born in 1972;
19. Ms Luiza Dudayeva;
20. Mr Kair Dudayev, born in 1972;
21. Mr Said-Magomed Dudayev;
22. Ms Zulikhan Dudayeva, born in 1987;
23. Ms Linda Dudayeva, born in 1997;
24. Mr Movsar Ibragimov;
25. Ms Atov Inderbayeva, born in 1960;
26. Mr Tamirkhan Inderbayev, born in 1993;
27. Ms Albina Inderbayeva (also known as Indarbayeva), born in 1998;
28. Mr Zayndi Magomadov;
29. Ms Tamara Makhmadova, born in 1940;
30. Mr Muhkarbek (also known as Makharbi) Mezhidov, born in 1989;
31. Ms Irsana Mezhidova, born in 1996;
32. Mr Akhmad (also known as Akhmed) Mezhidov, born in 1998;
33. Mr Mayrbek Mezhidov, born in 1995;
34. Ms Tamara Mukhmadova, born in 1941;
35. Mr Khizir Mukhmadov, born in 1995;
36. Ms Mata Mukhmadova, born in 1996;
37. Mr Ruslan Nadayev, born in 1991;
38. Mr Nur-Ali Nadayev, born in 1988;
39. Mr Turpal-Ali Nadayev, born in 1979;
40. Mr Uvays (also known as Ueys) Nanagayev, born in 1930;
41. Ms Ramazi Nanagayeva, born in 1968;
42. Mr Baysangur Petirov (also known as Musaitov), 1998;
43. Ms Khamsar Petirova, born in 1986;
44. Ms Anisat Tasuyeva, born in 1952;
45. Mr Khasan-Bek Khukayev;
46. Mr Timur Kharayev;
47. Ms Mariya Chumakova, born in 1958;
48. Ms Natasha Shuyeva, born in 1946;
49. Ms Elina Shuyeva, born in 1990;
50. Mr Soltakhan Shuyev, born in 1946;
51. Ms Milana Shuyeva, born in 1987;

52. Ms Layla Elikhanova, born in 1966;
53. Mr Akraman Etiyev, born in 1985;
54. Ms Diana Etiyeva, born in 1983;
55. Mr Minkail Yunayev, born in 1986;
56. Mr Shiti Yangulbayev, born in 1962;
57. Ms Zarvani Yangulbayeva, born in 1957;
58. Ms Maryan Yangulbayeva, born in 1975;
59. Ms Madina Yangulbayeva, born in 1984;
60. Ms Taisa Yaskiyeva.

### *3. Official investigation into the events*

On 14 December 2000 the Vedeno district prosecutor's office (hereinafter "the district prosecutor's office") opened criminal case no. 36039 to investigate the circumstances of the bombing on 7 October 1999 which resulted in the death of a relative of the fourth to seventh applicants, Mr Ramazan Appazov.

From the documents submitted it is apparent that no steps were taken to investigate the case between 1999 and 2007 as the case file was either lost or destroyed by fire. According to some of the documents furnished to the Court, the district prosecutor's office forwarded the criminal case file to the military prosecutor's office of military unit 20102 for investigation on 14 December 2000, and it was subsequently lost there. According to other documents submitted to the Court, there was a fire on the premises of the district prosecutor's office on 17 December 2002 which destroyed, amongst other things, the investigation file in the criminal case. It is unclear when the applicants were informed of either development in the investigation.

On an unspecified date in 2007 a relative of Mr Ramazan Appazov, Ms A. Tasuyeva, was granted victim status in the criminal case.

On various dates in 2007 Ms A. Tasuyeva's representative, a lawyer named S. Baskhanov (hereinafter "the lawyer") requested that the prosecutor's office provide information on the progress of the proceedings, but to no avail.

On 6 September 2007 the investigation of the criminal case was transferred to the Shali inter-district investigations department of the Investigative Committee of the Prosecutor's office (hereinafter "the investigators").

On 9 September 2007 the investigators requested that the military commander of the Vedeno district and the Central Archive of Russian Ministry of Defence provide them with information indicating whether any special operations had been conducted in Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999 by the Russian military air force and, if so, which military units had been involved, and under whose command. No reply to these requests was forthcoming.

On 5 October 2007 the investigation was suspended for failure to identify the perpetrators.

On 22 December 2007 the lawyer requested that the investigators allow him to access the contents of the investigation file. On 22 February 2008 his request was granted and he was allowed access to the file on an unspecified date in March 2008.

On 2 April 2008 the lawyer lodged an appeal against the suspension of the proceedings with the investigators' superiors, stating that it was unlawful and premature. In particular, he stated that the investigation had not established the full list of persons who had died as the result of the shelling and that numerous survivors had been neither questioned nor granted victim status in the

proceedings nor informed of their progress. The lawyer pointed out that the only person questioned by the investigators had been Ms Tasuyeva and that neither the sixty-odd wounded persons nor the relatives of the more than thirty residents killed during the attack had been questioned. No information concerning the military units which had participated in the aerial attack had been provided, nor had their commanders been identified. He also pointed out that the medical documentation concerning the victims of the attack, certifying that their deaths and/or the injuries had been caused by bombing, had not been analysed and added to the investigation file. Referring to the Court's case-law concerning Article 2 of the Convention, the lawyer requested that the investigators take prompt steps to establish and prosecute those responsible for the aerial attack.

On 14 April 2008 the sixteenth applicant, Ms Zarema Chumakova, requested that the investigators grant her victim status in the criminal case as her brother Mr Imran Chumakov had been killed during the aerial attack on 7 October 1999. In view of the need to question Ms Chumakova and grant her victim status in the case, the investigation was resumed on the same date.

On various dates between 14 April and 14 May 2008 Ms Zarema Chumakova and six other individuals were granted victim status in the criminal proceedings and questioned.

On 15 April 2008 the investigators questioned the thirty-fifth applicant, Mr Vakha Gekhayev, who stated that on 7 October 1999 he had been walking along the street in Elistanzhi when, at 11.45 a.m., military aeroplanes belonging to the Russian federal forces had started bombing the village. He had managed to hide in a ditch. As a result of the attack, his parents – Mr Adam Gekhayev and Ms Ayshat Gekhayeva – had been killed while they were in the house of his relatives, the Artsuyev family. Along with his parents, six members of that family – Ms Epsi Artsuyeva, Ms Khizhan Artsuyeva, Ms Shamsa Artsuyeva, Mr Artur Artsuyev, Mr Zaur Artsuyev and Mr Arbi Artsuyev – had been killed.

On 16 April 2008 the investigators questioned the twelfth applicant, Ms Raisa Artsuyeva, who stated that on 7 October 1999 she had been in her house in Elistanzhi with her four children – Taisa Artsuyeva, Luiza Artsuyeva, Razita Artsuyeva and Shaykh-Mansur Artsuyev – and their friend, Elina Shuyeva. At 11.45 a.m. military aeroplanes belonging to the Russian federal forces had started bombing the village. Two of the bombs had hit her home. As a result, her daughter Taisa had been killed and all the other four children had sustained various injuries.

On the same date, 16 April 2008, the investigators questioned the seventeenth applicant, Ms Alet Davletmurzayeva (in the documents submitted also spelt as Aleta Daletmerzayeva) who stated that on 7 October 1999 she had been in the nearby town of Shali on an errand when at about 11.30 she had seen military aeroplanes belonging to the federal forces flying in the direction of Elistanzhi and then, about 5-10 minutes later, had heard the sound of explosions. She had gone to her relatives' house in Shali, where her father, Mr Abdurakhman Davletmurzayev, had arrived about 40 minutes later, covered in blood. He had told her that her sister, the twentieth applicant, Ms Zulpa Davletmurzayeva and her son, Albek Khamzatov, had been wounded as a result of the military airstrike. Immediately after that she had got into her car with her husband and had driven to Elistanzhi. In the vicinity of the village they had seen many local women and children running away from the ongoing bombing.

On 17 April 2008 the investigators questioned the twentieth applicant, Ms Zulpa Davletmurzayeva, who stated that on 7 October 1999 she had been in her parents' house in Elistanzhi when, at about 11.40 a.m., she had heard the sound of aeroplanes approaching. Shortly afterwards, they had started bombing the village. She had wanted to take her three nephews down into the basement, but on the way there she and her nephew Elbert Khamzatov had been wounded by shrapnel and Elbert had died shortly afterwards. As a result of the bombing, her mother, Ms Zulay Davletmurzayeva, and her nephew Islam Davletmurzayev had sustained serious injuries; more than thirty people had been killed and more than sixty others wounded.

On 17 April 2008 the investigators questioned Ms Nurbika Musaidova, the sixtieth applicant Ms Khamsar Petirova, and the sixteenth applicant Ms Zarema Chumakova. Their statements concerning the bombing of Elistanzhi were similar to those given by the other witnesses.

On 14 May 2008 the investigation was suspended again.

On an unspecified date between 15 May and 17 August 2008 the investigators received instructions from their superiors in the procedural control department of the Chechnya Investigative Committee ordering them to carry out a number of actions, including a crime scene examination. Those orders were not complied with.

On 18 August 2008 the investigators resumed the investigation and decided to transfer it to military investigations department no. 506 of military unit no. 68798, since "a criminal case against military servicemen falls within the jurisdiction of military investigations departments".

On 26 August 2008 the transfer of the investigation was overruled by the investigators' superiors and the case file was returned to the investigators in view of their failure to carry out a number of essential actions – such as questioning key witnesses – and the lack of forensic expert evaluations.

On 18 September 2008 the investigators suspended the proceedings again.

On 11 November 2008 (in some of the documents submitted the date was also referred to as 19 November 2008) the Vedeno prosecutor criticised the investigation in the criminal case. He stated that it had been incomplete and that the decision to suspend the proceedings had been unlawful and premature. In particular, he stressed that the investigators had failed to execute their superiors' orders, such as conducting a crime scene examination, and ordered that the investigation be resumed. On 24 November 2008 it was resumed.

On 24 December 2008 the investigation was suspended again and on 11 January 2009 it was resumed again on the orders of the investigators' superiors, as it had been suspended prematurely. In particular, it was pointed out that the investigators had failed to carry out the actions ordered on 26 August 2008 such as establishing the identity of all the village residents who had been killed during the bombing, and obtaining medical documents certifying the injuries of those who had been wounded during the attack.

On 14 February 2009 the investigation was suspended again. It appears that some of the applicants were informed thereof.

On 25 March 2009 the deputy head of the Shali investigations department criticised the investigators for their failure to comply with the previously issued instructions and ordered that the proceedings be resumed. The relevant part of the decision stated as follows:

“ [...] although the investigation file contains information concerning the presence of an unexploded bomb, launched on the day of the attack by one of the aeroplanes, and lying on the property of Mr A. Artsuyev, at a depth of two metres below ground, the investigation has taken no steps to seize and examine that projectile; not all of the victims of the bombing have been identified and questioned, nor have expert forensic evaluations been commissioned in this regard. Moreover, the orders of 26 August 2008 have not been executed...”

On 3 August 2009 the lawyer appealed against the suspension of the investigation to the Vedeno District Court. He stated that the investigators had not established the identity of all of the 35 residents who had died as result of the attack or of the more than 50 people who had been injured; despite the fact that several residents had been granted victim status in the criminal case, they had not been informed of any of the developments in the proceedings. He further pointed out that the investigation had still not either examined the crime scene or collected the unexploded projectiles lying in Mr Artsuyev’s courtyard and the local school building. He pointed out that the victims of the attack had medical documentation confirming that their injuries had been sustained as a result of the bombing. Furthermore, referring to Article 2 of the Convention and the relevant case-law, the lawyer stated that the investigation had been ineffective, requested that it be resumed and the actions ordered by the investigators’ superiors be taken. Finally, he stated that the victims would lodge an application with the Court should the authorities continue to fail to investigate the matter effectively.

On 21 August 2009 the Vedeno District Court allowed the lawyer’s complaint and ordered the investigators to establish the identities of all of the victims of the bombing, both killed and injured. It also ordered that the investigators examine the crime scene, seize the unexploded projectiles and obtain information from the Central Archives of Ministry of Defence, from the Ministry of Internal Affairs, and from the Federal Security Service concerning any special operation linked to the airstrike on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999.

On 21 August 2009 the investigation was resumed and then suspended again on 21 September 2009. It appears that none of the actions ordered by the court were carried out.

On an unspecified date in October or November 2009 the lawyer appealed against that suspension to the Vedeno District Court. On 29 December 2009 the investigation was resumed again and on 30 December 2009 the Vedeno District Court therefore rejected the lawyer’s appeal as unsubstantiated.

On 28 January 2010 the investigation was suspended again.

On 31 March 2010 the lawyer requested that the investigators allow him access to the investigation file. On 1 April 2010 his request was granted.

On an unspecified date between April and August 2010 the lawyer again appealed against the suspension of the proceedings, but this time to the head of the Chechnya investigations committee. He requested that the investigators’ supervisors examine the lawfulness and the grounds for the suspension. His complaint was left without examination.

On 25 August 2010 the investigation was resumed yet again and the case file was forwarded to the Chechnya investigations committee for a decision regarding its transfer to the military investigators.

On 17 December 2010 the lawyer requested that the investigators inform him of the outcome of his complaint concerning the unlawfulness of the suspension of the criminal proceedings.

On 22 December 2010 the lawyer was informed that the investigation of the criminal case had been transferred to military investigations department no. 506 of military unit no. 68798.

On 14 March 2011, in reply to his request of 31 January 2011, the lawyer was informed by military investigations department no. 506 that on 11 January 2011 they had transferred the criminal case for further investigation to the 3<sup>rd</sup> military investigations department of the Southern Military Circuit in Khankala.

On 28 March 2011 the lawyer requested that the military investigations department of the Southern Military Circuit in Khankala inform him of the progress made in the investigation of the criminal case.

On 31 March 2011 the military investigations department in Khankala refused to provide any information concerning the investigation as the criminal case file did not contain an authority form certifying that the lawyer could represent victims of the bombing.

On 4 April 2011 the investigation in the criminal case was suspended again.

From the documents submitted it is apparent that the investigation into the the circumstances of the bombing of Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999 is still pending.

## **B. Relevant domestic law**

For a summary of the relevant domestic law and international regulations see *Abakarova*, cited above, §§ 59-70.

## COMPLAINTS

The applicants complain under Article 2 of the Convention that because of the bombing of their village by the Russian military there was a violation of the right to life in respect of not only their thirty-five deceased relatives but also, in view of the level of danger surrounding the attack, in respect of themselves. The applicants further allege that the authorities failed to effectively investigate the matter.

Under Article 13 of the Convention, the applicants complain that they have no effective domestic remedies against the alleged violations.



### QUESTIONS TO THE PARTIES

1. Did each of the applicants comply with the six-month requirement under Article 35 § 1 of the Convention? In particular, when should the applicants have become aware of the ineffectiveness of the domestic proceedings?

2. Has the right to life, as guaranteed by Article 2 of the Convention, been violated in respect of the applicants and their relatives who died or were wounded as a result of the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999?

3. Having regard to the procedural protection of the right to life under Article 2 of the Convention (see *Salman v. Turkey* [GC], no. 21986/93, § 104, ECHR 2000-VII and *Abakarova v. Russia*, no. 16664/07, §§ 110-14, 15 October 2015), was the investigation conducted by the domestic authorities sufficient to meet their obligation to carry out an effective investigation?

4. Did the applicants have at their disposal effective domestic remedies in respect of their above complaints, as required by Article 13 of the Convention?

5. The applicants are requested to submit the following information:

a) copies of their identity documents and those of their relatives deceased or wounded as a result of the aerial strike of 7 October 1999 in Elistanzhi.

b) information on their individual status in the criminal proceeding opened in connection with the attack of 7 October 1999.

6. The Government are invited to provide the following information and copies of relevant documents:

a) a complete list stating the causes of the deaths and injuries of the applicants and their relatives;

b) any expert reports carried out on the proportionality and compatibility of the lethal force used;

c) any expert reports or inquiries and/or criminal investigation files concerning individual responsibility between the military and the civilian authorities for the aerial strike of 7 October 1999 in Elistanzhi.

7. The Government are also invited to provide a complete list of the main investigative steps taken in criminal case no. 36039 and copies of the relevant documents.

**APPENDIX**

No.	Applicant's name	Birth year	Nationality	Place of residence	Kinship to the victims and/or injuries sustained during the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999
1.	Ms Zarema ABAZOVA	1976	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Multiple shrapnel wounds to the face, deep abrasion of the left collar joint and forearm.
2.	Ms Umulkusul AKHAZAYEVA (in the documents submitted also referred to as Petimat AKHAZAYEVA)	1968 or 1972	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Multiple blunt shrapnel wounds to the chest and the lower back.
3.	Ms Laura AKHMATKHANOVA	1986	Russian	Grozny, Chechen Republic	Penetrating shrapnel wound to the temple with injury to the cheek bone; brain concussion, eye contusion with partial loss of vision.
4.	Mr Khaseyn APPAZOV	1982	Russian	Grozny, Chechen Republic	Chronic post-traumatic and astheno-subdepressive syndromes.  The applicant is the son of Mr Ramazan Appazov, who was born in 1927 and died during the attack.

No.	Applicant's name	Birth year	Nationality	Place of residence	Kinship to the victims and/or injuries sustained during the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999
5.	Mr Khuseyn APPAZOV	1982		Kargalinskoye, Kazakhstan	The applicant is the son of Mr Ramazan Appazov, who was born in 1927 and died during the attack.
6.	Mr Rukman APPAZOV	1974		Kargalinskoye, Kazakhstan	The applicant is the son of Mr Ramazan Appazov, who was born in 1927 and died during the attack.
7.	Ms Rumi APPAZOVA	1979		Kargalinskoye, Kazakhstan	The applicant is the daughter of Mr Ramazan Appazov, who was born in 1927 and died during the attack.
8.	Mr Ali ARTSUYEV	1957	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the son of Ms Epsi Artusyeva, who was born in 1920 and died during the attack and the father of four children who also died during the attack: Mr Iznaur Artsuyev, who was born in 1982, Ms Milana Artsuyeva, who was born in 1984, Mr Zaur Artsuyev, who was born in 1990 and Mr Anzor Artsuyev, who was born in 1997.
9.	Mr Saykhan ARTSUYEV (also known as ABDUSALAMOV)	1991	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Cranio-cerebral injury of the fourth degree of severity with brain contusion. The applicant has disability of the second degree.
10.	Mr Shaykh-Mansur (also known as Sheykh-Manur) ARTSUYEV	1999	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Severance of the right foot, amputation of the leg below left knee, neurosis, development of neurotic personality due to the physical injuries, enuresis.

No.	Applicant's name	Birth year	Nationality	Place of residence	Kinship to the victims and/or injuries sustained during the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999
					The applicant is the brother of Mr Shamsuddin Artsuyev, who was born in 1988 and died during the attack and of Ms Taisa Artsuyeva, who was born in 1989 and died during the attack.
11.	Ms Luiza ARTSUYEVA	1996	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the sister of Mr Shamsuddin Artsuyev, who was born in 1988 and died during the attack and of Ms Taisa Artsuyeva, who was born in 1989 and died during the attack.
12.	Ms Raisa ARTSUYEVA	1969	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the mother of Mr Shamsuddin Artsuyev, who was born in 1988 and died during the attack and of Ms Taisa Artsuyeva, who was born in 1989 and died during the attack.
13.	Ms Razita ARTSUYEVA	1995	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the sister of Mr Shamsuddin Artsuyev, who was born in 1988 and died during the attack and of Ms Taisa Artsuyeva, who was born in 1989 and died during the attack.
14.	Ms Zura BADAYEVA	1966	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Non-penetrating shrapnel wounds to the chest and the buttocks.
15.	Ms Layla CHUMAKOVA	1948	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the mother of Mr Imran Chumakov, who was born in 1989 and died during the attack.

No.	Applicant's name	Birth year	Nationality	Place of residence	Kinship to the victims and/or injuries sustained during the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999
16.	Ms Zarema CHUMAKOVA	1971	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the sister of Mr Imran Chumakov, who was born in 1989 and died during the attack.
17.	Ms Aleta (also spelt as Alet) DAULETMURZAYEVA	1967	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the mother of Mr Albert Khamzatov, who was born in 1993 and died during the attack.
18.	Mr Islam DAVLETMURZAYEV	1994	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Numerous shrapnel wounds to the face.
19.	Ms Zulay DAVLETMURZAYEVA	1947	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Numerous shrapnel wounds to the legs.
20.	Ms Zulpa DAVLETMURZAYEVA	1972	Russian	Grozny, Chechen Republic	Numerous shrapnel wounds, as a result of which the applicant has disability of the third degree.
21.	Mr Sayd-Magomed DUDAYEV	1937	Russian	Argun, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the brother of Mr Supyan Dudayev, who was born in 1947 and died during the attack.
22.	Ms Zura DUDAYEVA	1947	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the mother of Mr Aslan Dudayev, who was born in 1973 and died during the attack.
23.	Ms Layla ELIKHANOVA	1966	Russian	Grozny, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wounds.

No.	Applicant's name	Birth year	Nationality	Place of residence	Kinship to the victims and/or injuries sustained during the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999
24.	Mr Akraman ETIYEV	1985	Russian	Kalinovskaya, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wounds to the buttocks.
25.	Ms Diana ETIYEVA	1983	Russian	Kalinovskaya, Chechen Republic	Sharpnel wounds to the shin and hip.
26.	Mr Bislan GABAYEV	1994	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the son of Ms Madina Gabayeva, who was born in 1956 and died during the attack.
27.	Mr Islam GABAYEV	1989	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the son of Ms Madina Gabayeva, who was born in 1956 and died during the attack.
28.	Mr Rasul GABAYEV	1980	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the son of Ms Madina Gabayeva, who was born in 1956 and died during the attack.
29.	Ms Marina GABAYEVA	1982	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the daughter of Ms Madina Gabayeva, who was born in 1956 and died during the attack.
30.	Mr Sharip (also known as Sherip) GASTIYEV	1978	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Numerous shrapnel wounds to the legs, back and buttocks.
31.	Mr Sirazhdin GASTIYEV	1970	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wounds to the left shoulder, craniocerebral injury with brain contusion. As the result, the applicant has disability of the second degree.

No.	Applicant's name	Birth year	Nationality	Place of residence	Kinship to the victims and/or injuries sustained during the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999
32.	Ms Khazan GATSAYEVA	1939	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wounds to the left buttock area.
33.	Ms Aminat GAZIYEVA (in the documents submitted also referred to as Ms Aminat CHUMAKOVA)	1965	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	At the time of the attack, the applicant was pregnant. She received a shrapnel wound to the abdominal cavity. As a result, the foetus was lost and 2.5 metres of bowel were removed.
34.	Mr Magomed GEKHAYEV	1929	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the brother of Ms Khizhan Dosuyeva, who was born in 1928 and died during the attack.
35.	Mr Vakha GEKHAYEV	1973	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the son of Ms Ayshat Gekhayeva, who was born in 1940 and Mr Adam Gekhayev, who was born in 1937, both of whom died during the attack.
36.	Ms Roza GEKHAYEVA (in the documents submitted also referred to as Ms Roza DUDAYEVA)	1962	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the wife of Mr Supyan Dudayev, who was born in 1947 and died during the attack.
37.	Mr Tamirkhan INDERBAYEV	1993	Russian	Grozny, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wounds to the head.

No.	Applicant's name	Birth year	Nationality	Place of residence	Kinship to the victims and/or injuries sustained during the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999
38.	Ms Albina INDERBAYEVA (also spelt as INDARBAYEVA)	1998	Russian	Grozny, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wounds to the back and right hip.
39.	Ms Atov INDERBAYEVA	1960	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Numerous shrapnel wounds to the legs and an arm.
40.	Mr Akhmed KHAMZATOV	1966	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the father of Mr Albert Khamzatov, who was born in 1993 and died during the attack.
41.	Mr Akhmad (also spelt as Akhmed) MEZHIDOV	1998	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Explosion barotrauma of the left ear with bleeding.
42.	Mr Lomali (also spelled as Lom-Ali) MEZHIDOV	1967	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the son of Ms Ibanat Mezhidova, who was born in 1928 and died during the attack.
43.	Mr Mayrbek MEZHIDOV	1995	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Numerous open fractures of the left forearm and the hand and an open fracture of the right hand.
44.	Mr Mukharbek (also spelt as Makharbi) MEZHIDOV	1989	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wound to the left forearm, open fracture of the left radial bone, numerous fractures of the right forearm and shrapnel wound to the right hip.



No.	Applicant's name	Birth year	Nationality	Place of residence	Kinship to the victims and/or injuries sustained during the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999
45.	Ms Irsana MEZHIDOVA	1996	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wound to right side of the ribcage, wound to the abdominal wall, traumatic and haemorrhagic shocks.
46.	Mr Khizir MUKHMADOV	1995	Russian	Grozny, Chechen Republic	Trauma caused by mine explosion, numerous wounds. Organic injury of the central nervous system, hypertension, traumatic neuritis of the left elbow nerve. The applicant has childhood disability.
47.	Mr Movladi MUKHMADOV	1964	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the brother of Mr Islam Mukhmadov, who was born in 1976 and Ms Malkan Mukhamdova, who was born in 1974, both of whom died during the attack.
48.	Ms Tamara MUKHMADOVA	1940	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Numerous shrapnel wounds, abrasions and hematomas of the body.  The applicant is the mother of Mr Islam Mukhmadov, who was born in 1976 and Ms Malkan Mukhamdova, who was born in 1974, both of whom died during the attack.
49.	Mr Aslan NADAYEV	1977	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the brother of Mr Asvad Nadayev, who was born in 1974 and died during the attack.

No.	Applicant's name	Birth year	Nationality	Place of residence	Kinship to the victims and/or injuries sustained during the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999
50.	Mr Nurali (also spelt as Nur-Ali) NADAYEV	1986	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	An injury. The applicant is the brother of Mr Asvad Nadayev, who was born in 1974 and died during the attack.
51.	Mr Ruslan NADAYEV	1991	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	An injury. The applicant is the brother of Mr Asvad Nadayev, who was born in 1974 and died during the attack.
52.	Mr Turpal-Ali NADAYEV	1979	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	An injury. The applicant is the brother of Mr Asvad Nadayev, who was born in 1974 and died during the attack.
53.	Mr Umar-Ali NADAYEV	1980	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the brother of Mr Asvad Nadayev, who was born in 1974 and died during the attack.
54.	Mr Visadi NADAYEV	1952	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the father of Mr Asvad Nadayev, who was born in 1974 and died during the attack.
55.	Ms Sapet NADAYEVA	1953	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the mother of Mr Asvad Nadayev, who was born in 1974 and died during the attack.
56.	Mr Uvays (also spelled as Ueys) NANAGAYEV	1930	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Barotrauma, deafness, numerous shrapnel wounds to the extremities and the head.

No.	Applicant's name	Birth year	Nationality	Place of residence	Kinship to the victims and/or injuries sustained during the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999
57.	Ms Ramazi NANAGAYEVA	1968	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wound to the right buttock and the shoulder blade areas.
58.	Mr Lema OSUPOV	1973	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the husband of Ms Ima Osupova, who died during the attack.
59.	Mr Baysangur PETIROV	1998	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wounds to the head, left ear, left shoulder, both hands and left shin.
60.	Ms Khamsar PETIROVA	1986	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wound to the left shin. The applicant is the sister of Ms Satitsa Petirova, who was born in 1985 and died during the attack.
61.	Ms Tamusa PETIROVA	1958	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the mother of Ms Satitsa Petirova, who was born in 1985 and died during the attack.
62.	Mr Khavazh-Bauddi SAITOV	1980	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the son of Ms Eset Saitova, who died during the attack and the brother of Mr Islam Saitov, who was born in 1994 and died during the attack.
63.	Mr Soltakhan SHUYEV	1946	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Displacement of several vertebrae by the blast wave.
64.	Ms Elina SHUYEVA	1990	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Penetrating shrapnel wounds to the chest and the legs. Some pieces of shrapnel have still not been removed from the tissues.

No.	Applicant's name	Birth year	Nationality	Place of residence	Kinship to the victims and/or injuries sustained during the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999
65.	Ms Milana SHUYEVA	1987	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wound to the right shoulder.
66.	Ms Natasha SHUYEVA	1946	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Blind shrapnel wound to the back and the lower back.
67.	Ms Anisat TASUYEVA	1952	Russian	Kalinovskaya, Chechen Republic	Numerous blind shrapnel wounds to the right buttock.  The applicant is the mother of Mr Musa Tasuyev, who was born in 1982 and died during the attack.
68.	Ms Roza VISARIGOVA	1966	Russian	Kalinovskaya, Chechen Republic	Numerous shrapnel wounds to the legs and the lower back; as the result of the injuries the applicant has third degree of disability.  The applicant is the mother of Ms Petimat Visarigova, who was born in 1991 and died during the attack.
69.	Mr Shiti YANGULBAYEV	1962	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Multiple shrapnel wounds to the neck and the chest.
70.	Ms Madina YANGULBAYEVA	1984	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Multiple shrapnel wounds to the extremities, hematomas and abrasions of the back, amputation of the right hand,

No.	Applicant's name	Birth year	Nationality	Place of residence	Kinship to the victims and/or injuries sustained during the aerial attack on Elistanzhi on 7 October 1999
					traumatic and haemorrhagic shocks of the third degree. As a result, the applicant has disability of the third degree.
71.	Ms Maryan YANGULBAYEVA	1975	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	Multiple shrapnel wounds to the left shin and the ankle. Traumatic and haemorrhagic shocks of the first degree.
72.	Ms Zarvani YANGULBAYEVA	1959	Russian	Naurskaya, Chechen Republic	Shrapnel wounds to the right shoulder, right foot, traumatic and haemorrhagic shocks of the second degree. As a result, the applicant has disability of the second degree.
73.	Mr Minkail YUNAYEV	1986	Russian	Grozny, Chechen Republic	Numerous wounds to the face, eyes, head and both hands.
74.	Mr Turpal-Ali YUNAYEV	1988	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the son of Mr Nesirkho Yunayev, who was born in 1957 and died during the attack.
75.	Ms Zalpa YUNAYEVA	1960	Russian	Elistanzhi, Chechen Republic	The applicant is the wife of Mr Nesirkho Yunayev, who was born in 1957 and died during the attack.